

MADISON AVENUE PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH

CONFIDENTIAL

March 31, 1998

To: the Session
From: Chuck Amstein

Since the death of Julia Taschereau on March 16, it has become clear that her daughters, Elizabeth (Betsy) Combier who lives here in the city, and Julia (Jill) Danger who lives in Paris are not only not finding it possible to be reconciled to one another, but they are in fact about to be involved in a law suit against each other. This would seem to be happening for what I would call the classic reason in such matters. Jill now knows that her mother drafted a new Will in November which not only does not name her, but also does not name her two children. Jill is going to file suit against Betsy, seeking some portion of their mother's estate for herself, and for her children.

In order to move this church toward a position of neutrality in this matter, and more importantly, as a reflection of the actual relationship which has existed for some time between Betsy Combier and Jill Danger, and MAPC, I would like to recommend that we transfer both of them to the Inactive Members' Roll this evening.

Those of you who know Betsy Combier know that she and her children have been going to the Brick Church for more than two years. We have never had Jill Danger's address in Paris, and she has not worshipped at MAPC when she has been here in the summer.

It was always clear to me that it mattered to Julia Taschereau that her daughters continue to be listed as active members here, while she was alive. And as we all know, Julia could not have been a more devoted and helpful member of this congregation. Some who have known Betsy and Jill much longer than I have maintain that they have never really enjoyed each other as sisters. I just feel strongly that we will honor Julia's memory better if we officially distance ourselves from her daughters at this time. They have already distanced themselves from this church.

We have also had communication from our member, Elisabeth [redacted] who now lives in Rowayton, Ct., saying that we should stop sending her MAPC mail, as she is attending a church there, and expects to become a member. We can't properly send a letter of transfer until that church requests it, so for now I think it appropriate to keep her on the Active Roll here. Or we could transfer her to the Inactive Roll, and then activate and transfer her when we receive a request from the other church.

19 May 98
9:40 am

From: Fred R. Anderson (FRA)
To: CAA
Date: Tuesday, May 19, 1998 9:40 am
Subject: Betsy -Reply

Betsy did call Presbytery and talked with the new Stated Clerk, who is a bit of an eager beaver.

Spencer and I have talked about it. the issue from his perspective that the twins can be taken off the roll for inactivity, not because of their incivility to one another.

I find that an interesting notion of church discipline, and an interesting notion of the power of the session. But, neither is the real point.

40 40 40

I plan to write Betsy a letter telling her that the real issue was her and Jill's inactivity, and that we kept them on the church roll for years in deference to their mother. Now that Julia is gone there is no longer reason to do that. I will acknowledge that you did mention their difficulties and your desire to distance the church from their future conflicts, but, the Session voted to remove them from the active roll because of their inactivity for the last two years. I will also back that up with references to a letter she wrote to me about a year ago. I will also tell her that if she wishes to talk to Session about this, I will appoint a commission to meet with her to discuss her membership, and ask the commission to make recommendations to the session. I will be clear that she is not being invited to meet with the session.

We could maintain the stand on the conflict, but that would probably put us into an church polity debate at Presbtery, which we don't need to waste time doing. Betsy's inactivity is sufficient. By the way, I was dumbfounded not to see her in worship this last Sunday. One would think that if she wanted to make an issue of this, she would have been there as she was last year.

To my knowledge, Betsy has been in worship twice in the last two years: the Sunday of the infamous Congregational Meeting last September and a week ago last Sunday. Not, what one would call, active.

MOre later.



MADISON AVENUE PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH

921 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10021-3595 (212) 288-8920 Fax (212) 249-1466



August 25, 1999

Ms. Anne Castaldo
Aon Risk Services, Floor 103
2 World Trade Center
New York, NY 10048

Dear Anne,

Richard Frey has asked me to send you a copy of this complaint. It reached our office last Wednesday afternoon, August 18. I had left for the day, and Richard's assistant, John Clarke, put the several copies of the document in the safe. Although I was in the office on Friday, John did not return to the office until Monday, which is when I first saw this.

As Richard probably told you, Elizabeth Combier had been in a dispute with this church before the Permanent Judicial Commission of this Presbytery because our Session had voted to place her on our Inactive Members' Roll. The Judicial Commission asked that she be restored to the Active Roll, and Session voted to do this on June 22, 1999.

I have known Elizabeth Combier well during the whole time I have worked here, now more than 22 years. She is in civil litigation with her sister. I understand that the sister, Jill Danger, has now filed three law suits against Elizabeth Combier. I certainly don't think we have defamed her, but I do know that she has to have a lot of legal expenses to deal with, and I think that is what has caused her to file this complaint.

untrue
? huh?

I think Richard has conveyed to you the names of the two lawyers from this congregation who are aware of this whole matter. One is Sharon Davison (212/656-6419). She was involved in the whole matter of the ecclesiastical dispute between Elizabeth Combier and this church. When this current complaint came, Sharon immediately called another lawyer in the congregation, John Beerbower (212/474-1864), because Sharon works at the Stock Exchange, while John Beerbower and his firm deal with this sort of litigation.

USTRUST
Ethics/
Compliance!!

I will be out of town from tomorrow until Tuesday of next week, but I will be checking my office voice mail. Our pastor, Fred Anderson, is on vacation in New Hampshire, but he knows that this complaint has reached us.

Sincerely,

Charles A. Amstein
Associate Pastor

The Rev. Charles A. Amstein, *Associate Pastor*
Dr. John Weaver, *Music Director / Organist*
Patricia S. Pell, *Day School Director*

The Rev. Dr. Fred R. Anderson, *Pastor*
The Rev. Dr. David H.C. Read, *Pastor Emeritus*

J. Richard Frey, *Business Manager*
Fred W. Linstedt, *Building Services Director*
J. Michael Bart, *Communications / Systems*